



**THE STATES assembled on Thursday  
2nd April 2009, at 09.30 a.m. under  
the Presidency of  
Mr. Michael Nelson de la Haye,  
Greffier of the States.**

---

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Senator Stuart Syvret – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.57 a.m.)  
Senator James Leslie Perchar d – en défaut  
Senator Alan Breckon – en défaut  
Senator Sarah Craig Ferguson – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.57 a.m.)  
Connétable Graeme Frank Butcher of St John – en défaut  
Deputy Deborah Jane de Sousa of St. Helier – excused attendance

---

Prayers

---

***Ex gratia* compensation payment: Mr. and Mrs. R. Pinel P.29/2009**

THE STATES resumed consideration of a proposition of Senator Ben Edward Shenton concerning the payment of ex gratia compensation to Mr. and Mrs. R. Pinel, and rejected a proposition of Deputy Robert Charles Duhamel of St. Saviour that the Assembly move to the consideration of the next item on the Order Paper.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 8**

Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
Deputy of Trinity  
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)  
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**CONTRE: 34**

Senator S. Syvret  
Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
Senator P.F. Routier  
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
Senator T.J. Le Main  
Senator B.E. Shenton  
Senator F.E. Cohen  
Senator S.C. Ferguson  
Senator A.J.D. Maclean  
Connétable of St. Ouen  
Connétable of Trinity  
Connétable of Grouville  
Connétable of St. Brelade  
Connétable of St. Saviour  
Connétable of St. Clement  
Connétable of St. Peter  
Connétable of St. Lawrence  
Deputy of St. Martin  
Deputy R.G. Le Hérisseier (S)  
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
Deputy of St. Ouen

**ABSTAIN: 2**

Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
Connétable of St. Mary

Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)

THE STATES rejected a proposition of Senator Ben Edward Shenton –

- (a) to approve the making of an *ex gratia* payment of £297,469.59 to Mr. and Mrs. R. Pinel (Reg's Skips Limited) as compensation for costs incurred in defending the *voisinage* action brought against them as set out in the Appendix;
- (b) to request the Chief Minister, in consultation with the Minister for Treasury and Resources, to make provision in the draft Annual Business Plan 2010 to meet the cost of the payment.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 17**

Senator S. Syvret  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**CONTRE: 24**

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator A.J.D. Maclean  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)

**ABSTAIN: 5**

Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)

**Declaration of interest**

Deputy Montfort Tadier of St. Brelade declared an interest and withdrew from the Chamber during consideration of the matter. In accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 106(b), the Connétables of St. Martin and St. Mary, and Deputy John Alexander Nicholas Le Fondré of St. Lawrence declared an interest not being of a direct financial nature, but remained in the Chamber for the duration of the debate.

**Arrangement of public business for present meeting**

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of Senator Stuart Syvret, agreed to defer consideration of the proposition of the Deputy of St. Martin entitled 'Police Complaints and Discipline: extension to Honorary Officers conducting Parish Hall Enquiries' (P.30/2009 lodged 'au Greffe' on 5th March 2009) until 28th April 2009.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 29**

Senator S. Syvret  
 Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator T.J. Le Main  
 Senator B.E. Shenton  
 Senator F.E. Cohen  
 Senator A.J.D. Maclean  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier (S)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)  
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)  
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)

**CONTRE: 18**

Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)  
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)  
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

**ABSTAIN: 0****Arrangement of public business for future meetings**

THE STATES agreed the following arrangement of public business for future meetings proposed, as amended, by the Chairman of the Privileges and Procedures Committee in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 88(3) –

**28th April 2009**

Police Complaints and Discipline: extension to Honorary Officers conducting Parish Hall Enquiries. P.30/2009.

Lodged: 5th March 2009.

*Deputy of St. Martin.*

Police Complaints and Discipline: extension to Honorary Officers conducting Parish Hall Enquiries (P.30/2009) – comments. P.30/2009.  
Com.

Presented: 30th March 2009.

*H.M. Attorney General.*

Code of Practice for Scrutiny Panels and the Public Accounts Committee: amendment. P.31/2009.

Lodged: 9th March 2009.

*Chairmen's Committee.*

Draft Sea Fisheries (Licensing of Fishing Boats) (Amendment No. 4) (Jersey) Regulations 200-. P.35/2009.

Lodged: 10th March 2009.

*Minister for Economic Development.*

Draft Public Elections (Amendment No. 3) (Jersey) Regulations 200-. P.36/2009.

Lodged: 13th March 2009.

*Comité des Connétables.*

Jersey Community Relations Trust: appointment of Trustee. P.38/2009.

Lodged: 19th March 2009.

*Minister for Home Affairs.*

Oral Questions with notice: extension to 2 hours. P.40/2009.

Lodged: 20th March 2009.

*Deputy of St. Martin.*

Electricity tariffs: Regulations under Article 22 of the Electricity (Jersey) Law 1937. P.41/2009.

Lodged: 24th March 2009.

*Senator A. Breckon.*

Suspension of States employees and States of Jersey Police Officers: revised procedures. P.46/2009.

Lodged: 31st March 2009.

*Deputy of St. Martin.*

Planning and Environment: division into 2 ministerial offices. P.47/2009.

Lodged: 1st April 2009.

*Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire of St. Helier.*

**12th May 2009**

La Pouquelaye old school site: provision of youth and community facilities. P.187/2008.

Lodged: 24th December 2008.

*Connétable of St. Helier.*

Public Elections (Jersey) Law 2002: rescindment of Article 39A. P.18/2009.

Lodged: 4th February 2009.

*Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier.*

Draft Health and Safety at Work (Amendment No. 4) (Jersey) Law 200-. P.37/2009.  
Lodged: 17th March 2009.  
*Minister for Social Security.*

Draft Loi (200-) (Amendement No. 11) réglant la procédure criminelle. P.39/2009.  
Lodged: 19th March 2009.  
*Minister for Home Affairs.*

Review of the roles of the Bailiff, Attorney General and Solicitor General: terms of P.44/2009.  
reference.  
Lodged: 31st March 2009.  
*Council of Ministers.*

Draft Housing (General Provisions) (Amendment No. 26) (Jersey) Regulations 200-. P.45/2009.  
Lodged: 31st March 2009.  
*Minister for Housing.*

### **19th May 2009**

### **2nd June 2009**

### **16th June 2009**

Natural gas pipeline: strategic study. P.16/2009.  
Lodged: 29th January 2009.  
*Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire of St. Helier.*

Natural gas pipeline: strategic study (P.16/2009) – comments. P.16/2009.  
Presented: 10th March 2009. Com.  
*Minister for Treasury and Resources.*

### **30th June 2009**

Williamson Report: Implementation Plan – funding. P.17/2009.  
Lodged: 4th February 2009.  
*Minister for Treasury and Resources.*

Williamson Report: Implementation Plan – funding (P.17/2009) – amendment. P.17/2009.  
Lodged: 25th March 2009. Amd.  
*Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier.*

States Members' remuneration for 2009. P.24/2009.  
Lodged: 19th February 2009.  
*Connétable of St. Peter.*

States Members' remuneration for 2009 (P.24/2009): comments. P.24/2009.  
Presented: 5th March 2009. Com.  
*Privileges and Procedures Committee.*

States Members' remuneration for 2009 (P.24/2009): amendment. P.24/2009.  
Lodged: 3rd March 2009. Amd.  
*Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire of St. Helier.*

Ann Court Site, St. Helier: use for sheltered social housing for the over-55s. P.43/2009.  
Lodged: 27th March 2009.

*Deputy J.A. Martin of St. Helier.*

THE STATES rose at 12.47 p.m.

**A.H. HARRIS**

*Deputy Greffier of the States*